

Wolof: "Liars, however numerous, will be caught by Truth when it rises up."

Yoruba: "Wherever a man goes to dwell his character goes with him."

"A mourner mourns and goes on her way, but one who ponders over sad memories mourns without ceasing."

"The wisdom of this year will be as folly in another."

"Full-belly child says to hungry-belly child, keep good heart."

Here we have examples from Polynesia and all parts of Africa; the meanings are so very obvious that no explanation is required. They are characteristically human and might be adopted and acted upon by other races which think themselves far in advance of savagery.

[TO BE CONCLUDED.]

THE ORIGIN OF JUDEO-CHRISTIAN WORSHIP.¹

BY MAXIMILIAN J. RUDWIN.

THE liturgy of the church is, as a matter of fact, an outgrowth of the liturgy of the synagogue. The earliest church service naturally was a synagogue service Christianized. The first Christian congregations, composed, chiefly, of Jews, retained the synagogue service in its main features. The Temple ritual, on the other hand, had very little direct influence on the church ritual. Prayer wholly divorced from the sacerdotal and sacrificial elements, as we find it in the church, is once and for all a heritage of the synagogue and not of the Temple. When the Exilic pseudo-Isaiah, who was of universalistic tendencies, says in the name of God: "For mine house shall be an house of prayer for all nations,"² he refers to the synagogue and not to the Temple. For the house of prayer in the Exilic and post-Exilic periods was the synagogue and not the Temple. But how did prayer come to take the place of sacrifice in Judea? The origin of Jewish prayer still lies in utter darkness. Between the sacrifices of the Temple and the prayers of the synagogue there yawns a chasm which all investigation has not yet

¹ This paper is a summary of a prize essay written ten years ago when the present writer was pursuing his studies in Biblical literature and comparative religion.

² Is. lvi. 7.

succeeded in bridging over. Prayer as distinct from sacrifice, as we find it in the synagogue and the church, is unquestionably not a result of Mosaic legislation. It cannot be found in the Priestly Code. Where shall we look, then, for its origin?

Prayer, of course, has always been an integral part of the sacrificial cult. The offering or oblation with which man approached his god was, as Chambers³ aptly states, an extension of the gift with which, as supplicant, he approached his fellow men. Even the "alimentary" sacrifice of food made to the dead, which rested on the belief in the continuance of the mortal life with its needs and desires after death, also included the element of oblation.⁴ When the departed ancestors were offered food and drink, they were prayerfully besought to accept these gifts and not to be angry with the living. Propitiation is the earliest phase of worship, and all oblations and sacrifices, cereal, animal, or human, were accompanied by some form or other of supplication and intercession. There can be no doubt, therefore, that the sacrifices in Tabernacle and Temple were followed up by prayers and petitions on behalf of those who brought them. When the men of Israel brought the first-fruits or tithes to the Temple, they offered the following prayer: "Look down from Thy holy habitation, from heaven, and bless Thy people Israel, and the land which Thou hast given us, as Thou swearest unto our fathers, a land that floweth with milk and honey."⁵ We may, indeed, rightly infer that if tithes required a prayer, sin-offerings were all the more to be accompanied, on the part of those who brought them, by a confession of sin and prayer for forgiveness and mercy.

But even if this our inference is correct we find no provision in the Mosaic legislation for prayers not connected with sacrifices. Of course, we read in the Bible that men like Jacob and Moses, Samson and Samuel prayed to their God in many a critical period in their lives. But there is no Biblical record of public prayer wholly dissociated from sacrifice. As a matter of fact, prayer as an institution did not exist in Judea prior to the Babylonian Exile. It was as exiles that the Judeans first learned how to pray. In a strange land they had neither Temple nor sacrifice. There remained for them only prayer in common. Warned by the oblivion which had overtaken the tribes of the Northern Kingdom, they set about to save themselves from a similar fate and instituted a new sanctuary. Thus arose the synagogue as a place for common prayer

³ E. K. Chambers, *The Mediæval Stage*, Oxford, 1903, Vol. I, p. 130.

⁴ For a discussion of the different phases of sacrifice see Chambers, *loc. cit.*

⁵ Deut. xxvi. 15.

and study. Jewish tradition traces the synagogue back to the time of Moses. But the synagogue is not expressly mentioned as a place of common worship until the early Maccabean period.⁶ We may, however, safely assume that the synagogue arose during the Exilic period as a successor to the Temple. It did not become an institution, though, until after the work of Ezra; and there is no doubt that in the post-Exilic period synagogues for public worship were organized, in addition to the national altar at Jerusalem, in all the provinces of Judea as well as in the Jewish settlements elsewhere. In the last century of the Temple public prayer received a great impetus from the efforts to establish the Pharisaic synagogue services in opposition to, or at least in correspondence with, the Sadducean Temple sacrifices.

Synagogue services were at first held twice on the Sabbath, on all feast and fast days, and on two weekly market-days, Monday and Thursday. But the synagogue did not at first wholly replace the Temple. Judea was divided into twenty-four districts, and each district sent every other week a delegation to Jerusalem to represent it at the sacrifices and prayers offered in the national sanctuary on behalf of all Israel. During the week that their representatives attended the sacrificial services in the Temple, the senders gathered day after day in their local synagogues to pray to the Lord that He might accept their offerings from the hands of their delegates in the national Temple. This custom doubtless was the origin of the daily synagogue prayers. Tradition, of course, names the men of the Great Synagogue as the founders of the daily synagogical prayers. But no contemporary evidence of such an ecclesiastical council is to be found anywhere, and only the first member—Ezra—and the last member—Simeon the Just, a contemporary of Alexander the Great—are known to us by name.⁷ Tradition may be right, however, if the term *Anshe Kencset Ha-Gedolah* is to include all who contributed to the preservation of the Jewish religion and the establishment of Jewish law and ritual, from the time of Ezra down to the Maccabean period. As a matter of fact, the synagogical liturgy could not have been instituted in one day, nor by one school. It was a movement which had sprung from the people, who, deprived of their Temple service, sought other ways and means to satisfy that longing for communion with God which is innate in every man.

⁶ Ps. lxxiv. 8. This psalm is now generally assigned to the Maccabean period.

⁷ Kuenen in his essay *Over de Mannen der Groote Synagoge* (1876) has argued that this tradition about a supreme religious authority in Judea is fiction.

This desire on the part of the Jewish people for a personal communion with the Deity received a great impetus from their contact with the Persians. It was during the Persian period that the Jewish people for the first time gave expression to their primitive and instinctive desire for prayer. Penitent and priest, from the Euphrates to the Ganges, greeted the appearance of the sun every morning with sacred prayers and songs. Should Israel, God's first-born, fall behind in this respect? Should not the nation of priests and the holy people also greet the sun, the first servant of the Lord in heaven? But the Judeans found great difficulty in adopting the cult of the Parsees. Their worship of the sun consisted in a representation of its appearance and motion. Upon the rise of the sun, the source of heat, they built in its semblance a great fire. By a similar symbolism they also mimicked the shape and motion of the sun with circular rotating bodies.⁸ This ceremony started as a heat-charm, as a magic in its "mimetic" form, as Dr. Frazer would call it, and was based in the pre-animistic stage of thought upon the principle of similarity, which holds that a thing can be influenced through what is similar to it. It has endured, however, into the animistic phase of religion; and in its readaptation to the new modes of thought it gave expression to the belief that impersonation was the most effective means of propitiation and conciliation. But how could the Jews with their transcendental beliefs impersonate their God? Of course, they imitated Him in pursuing righteousness. They were told to be holy, for so was their God. But how could they turn this imitation into a ritual act? Now if the Jews could not impersonate their God, as the Persians did, they at least could impersonate His servants. They had lately acquired from the Babylonians and Persians the theory of angels.⁹ They had been told that the angels, the Cherubim and Seraphim, formed the heavenly host, that they were God's community in heaven—the "Kedoshim," as the Psalmist calls them,¹⁰ the messengers of God, the powers of nature. They praised the Lord in the heavenly Temple. They greeted Him at the approach of daylight as the Lord of glory. Thus the Jews found an opportunity for emulating, if not God, at least His immediate servants. In this way the Kedoshim, the holy,

⁸ Our contention as to the origin of the Jewish prayers is fully borne out by the fact that to the present day the Jews keep their bodies in an incessant rotary motion when they recite their prayers.

⁹ In the Priestly Code there is no reference to angels apart from the possible suggestion in the ambiguous plural in Gen. i. 26. The pre-Exilic prophets barely mention them; see the article "Angel" in the *Enc. Brit.*, Vol. II, pp. 4ff.

¹⁰ Ps. lxxxix. 6, 8; cf. also Zech. xiv. 5.

pious men on earth, joined hands with the angels, the Kedoshim in heaven, in sanctifying the Lord and proclaiming Him thrice holy thrice a day. Following the Persian custom of invoking the sun three times each day—at dawn, at noon, and at dark—the Jewish exiles also praised the Lord at these periods of the day.¹¹ The Kedoshim, who in the “Kedushah,” the recital of the glorification of the holiness of the Lord by His angels,¹² are said to praise the Lord every day, are not the Jews, as most commentators maintain. Neither are the angels meant by this term, as Abudarham¹³ asserted, but the “Hassidim” or “Anabim,” the Jewish mystics, the holy and humble men in Israel; to whom life on earth was nothing but a continual praise and glorification of the Lord. The other Jewish tradition, which ascribes synagogical worship to these Hassidim, who are believed to have founded it at the destruction of the Temple, is therefore more correct than that tradition which credits the doctors of the law with it.¹⁴

It follows that the earliest form of prayer, the nucleus of the synagogical worship, was the Kedushah, the joint praise of God by His terrestrial community with His celestial community. The “Shema”¹⁵ as a part of the liturgy antedates the Kedushah, but this Biblical verse was originally no prayer at all, nor even a confession of faith, as is commonly assumed. It was a war-cry, and in its original form probably ran as follows: “Hear, O Israel, the battle-cry of our one God.” It must be further maintained that the minor Kedushah, which is a part of the Shema prayer, is older, although its form seems newer, than the major Kedushah, the third of the Eighteen Benedictions. But for reasons unknown to us now, the latter very soon eclipsed the former in importance.¹⁶

¹¹ The sun, moon, and stars were in the Jewish religion closely identified with angels.

¹² It forms the third benediction in the Jewish prayer called the Eighteen Benedictions. There are three responses in this “Glorificat”: (1) “Holy, holy, holy is the Lord of hosts; the whole earth is full of his glory” (Is. vi. 3); (2) “Blessed be the glory of the Lord from his place” (Ezek. iii. 12); (3) “The Lord shall reign for ever, even thy God, O Zion, unto all generations. Praise ye the Lord” (Ps. cxlvi. 10).

¹³ A commentator of the synagogical liturgy, who lived at Seville, Spain, about 1340 A. D.

¹⁴ See above.

¹⁵ The prayer is named “Shema” from its initial Hebrew word *shema*, which means “hear.” It reads: “Hear, O Israel, the Lord is our God, the Lord alone” (Deut. vi. 4).

¹⁶ At the beginning of the second century the Eighteen Benedictions formed the chief prayer of the synagogue. Of these eighteen, the third, the Kedushah, was the most important. How great its importance in the synagogical worship was can be learned from the following saying: “Since the

From the preceding conclusions it is very evident that the institution of prayer had its beginning with a small sect in Israel. The prayers which the Pharisees later legislated for all Israel, did not originate with them at all. It was the Kedoshim, the Hassidim, the Anabim, who were the first to learn from the Parsees how to pray. It now remains to be seen who these mystics were.

It may be a surprise to many a Jew to learn that these holy men of Judah, to whom he owes his prayer-book, were none other than the Essenes, from whose ranks the first Christians were recruited. Our knowledge of this sect, we must admit, is very limited. Reference is made to the Essenes only by Philo, Josephus, Pliny the Elder, and Eusebius of Cæsarea, while the Rabbinical literature wholly ignores them. The following quotation from Josephus, however, will support our contention that the Essenes were the first among the Judean exiles to learn from the Parsees the daily morning prayers. In his account of this interesting sect the Jewish historian tells us that "before the sun rises they (the Essenes) speak not a word about profane matters, but address to the sun certain prayers, which they have received from their forefathers, as if they supplicated it to rise."¹⁷ Somewhere else in the writings of Josephus we find the erroneous statement that "the Essenes had hereditary prayers to the sun, as well as the usual Jewish ritual books." This remark was made, of course, in full misunderstanding of the nature of their prayers. The Essenes were by no means sun-worshippers. The sun was to them not a god, but the greatest among the messengers of God; and its rise they conceived as its praise and sanctification—*kedushah* in Hebrew—in which they wished to join.

A further proof that the Kedushah, the prayer which expresses the joint praise of God by man and angel, originated with the Essenes is the following. We know that the Essenes had a great share in the production of the apocalyptic literature. We read that "Judah the Essene once sat in the Temple surrounded by his disciples, whom he initiated into the [apocalyptic] art of foretelling the future, when Antigonus passed by."¹⁸ It is indeed more than probable that the greater part of the apocalyptic literature emanated from their ranks. In this literature, moreover, do we find the

destruction of the Temple, the world is sustained by the Kedushah" (*Sotah* 49a). It is the only part of the synagogical service which must not be recited by an individual except in joint worship of a congregation of at least ten men (*Berachot* 21b).

¹⁷ *B. J.*, II, viii, 6.

¹⁸ *Ibid.*, I, iii, 5; *Ant.*, XIII, xi, 2.

earliest forms of the Kedushah. The theophanies in the Book of Enoch already contain the prototype of this prayer.

"For a time my eyes regarded that place and I blessed Him and extolled Him, saying: 'Blessed be and may He be blessed from the beginning for evermore' . . . Those that sleep not bless Thee: They stand before Thy glory and bless, laud and extol, saying: 'Holy, holy, holy is the Lord of Spirits: He filleth the earth with Spirits.'"¹⁹

"And He will call on all the host of the heavens and all the holy ones above, and the host of God, the Cherubim, Seraphim, Ophanim, and all the angels of power, and all the angels of principalities, and the Elect One, and the other powers on the earth, on the water, on that day: and they will raise one voice and bless and glorify in the spirit of faith, and in the spirit of wisdom, and of patience, and in the spirit of mercy, and in the spirit of judgment, and of peace, and in the spirit of goodness, and will say with one voice: 'Blessed is He, and may the name of the Lord of Spirits be blessed for ever and ever.'"²⁰

The first of these two passages is very similar to the Kedushah, as we now have it in the Jewish prayer-book, except that the order of the two responses is here reversed. It undoubtedly is the older form of this prayer. Its first part is more correct than the corresponding response in the final form of the Kedushah, which is a corrupt version of the Biblical text. "Blessed be the glory of the Lord from His place" as the passage now reads,²¹ is a corrupt form of: "When the glory of the Lord rose from its place." It was Samuel David Luzzato who first suggested that the first word of the passage in the Hebrew Bible originally must have been *berum* and not *baruch*. It follows that the Kedushah was already well established in usage in the second century B. C., for the Book of Enoch, which is already quoted in the Book of Jubilees, dates at least back to that period. The third response in the present form of the Kedushah is of late origin. It was added after the destruction of the Second Temple. "The Lord shall reign for ever, even thy God, O Zion, unto all generations. Praise ye the Lord,"²² was preferred because of its mention of Zion to the more authoritative and more sacred Pentateuchal verse: "The Lord will reign for ever and ever."²³ According

¹⁹ Book of Enoch, xxxix. 10-12.

²⁰ *Ibid.*, lxi. 10-11.

²¹ Ezek. iii. 12.

²² Ps. cxlvi. 10. See also above, note 10.

²³ Ex. xv. 8.

to Abudarham it was a principle with the Jews to mention Zion or Jerusalem in every one of their prayers.

Another form of the Kedushah is to be found in the book which bears the long title *Constitution of the Holy Apostles* [composed by] *Clemens, Bishop and Citizen of Rome,—Catholic Didascalia*. Though claimed to have been written by the Apostles, this work proves on closer examination to be based upon an original Jewish book "transformed," as a Jewish theologian expressed it, "by extensive interpolations and slight alterations into a Christian document of great authority." The prayer of sanctification as found in this book runs as follows:

"And the bright host of angels, and the intellectual spirits say to Palmoni: 'There is but one holy being,'²⁴ and the holy Seraphim, together with the six-winged Cherubim, who sing to Thee their triumphal song, cry out with never-ceasing voices: 'Holy, holy, holy, Lord of hosts! heaven and earth are full of Thy glory';²⁵ and the other multitudes of the orders, angels, archangels, thrones, dominions, principalities, authorities, and powers cry aloud and say: 'Blessed be the glory of the Lord out of His place.'²⁶ But Israel, Thy congregation on earth. . . .emulating the heavenly powers night and day, with a full heart and a willing soul, sings: 'The chariot of God is ten thousandfold thousands of them that rejoice; the Lord is among them in Sinai, in the holy place'²⁷. . . .The choir of stars strikes us with admiration, declaring Him that numbers them, and showing Him that names them; the animals declare Him that puts life into them; the trees show Him that makes them grow; all which creatures, being made by Thy word, show forth the greatness of Thy powers.'²⁸

A eulogy preceding this "Trisagion" and beginning with the words: "Great art Thou, O Lord Almighty, and great is Thy power," undoubtedly corresponds to the second benediction of the Eighteen Benedictions, which also begins: "Thou art great for ever, O Lord." We may safely assume, then, that this prayer of sanctification is the prototype of the Kedushah, as we now find it in the Jewish prayer-book.

The Kedushah in the prayer-book of the Falashahs,²⁹ shows great similarity to the prayer of sanctification in the Catholic

²⁴ Dan, viii. 13. The present English versions show variations from this rendering of the Masoretic text.

²⁵ Is. vi. 3.

²⁶ Exek. iii. 12.

²⁷ Ps. lxxvii. 17.

²⁸ Catholic Didascalia, VII, ii. 35.

²⁹ Edited by Joseph Halévy (Paris, 1877).

Didascalia. This is a proof of the early date of this prayer, as the separation of the Falashahs from the main body of Israel falls into pre-Talmudic times. It follows further that the church must have borrowed the Kedushah or Trisagion from the synagogue at a very early date. This prayer has, however, never occupied the important place in the Christian liturgy that it holds in Jewish public worship.

Now, who were the first to "emulate the heavenly powers night and day," and who were those that formed the link between the synagogical ritual and the ante-Nicene church liturgy as collected in the Apostolic Constitutions? They could be none other but the Essenes. Life on earth was to them, indeed, nothing but praise and song to the Lord. They were the Kedoshim, the terrestrial worshippers of God, who emulated His celestial worshippers, their models in heaven. They heard the music of the spheres, the harmony of the universe; and they wished to join in this chorus of praise and glory to the Lord on high.³⁰ Jesus of Nazareth, who was a member of this sect of Essenes, would also rise before daylight and go to a desert spot to pray and praise.³¹ From this Essene the world has learned to pray.

³⁰ The Kedushah owes the all-important place which it occupies in synagogical worship to the spiritual heirs of the Essenes, to the enthusiastic mystics of the early Gaonic period, the "Yorde Mercabah." The Kedushah as the expression of the glorification of the holiness of the Lord by the Mercabah angels had a deep interest for these pietists, as can be seen from the following prayer which is a part of the Kedushah in the prayer-book of Rab Amrom Gaon (died about 875 A. D.), head of the Surah academy and a prominent member of this pietistic sect.

"Come and see how pleasing it is to God when Israel says *Kadosh* (holy) before Him. For He exhorted the Yorde Mercabah that they should teach us in what way to pronounce *Kadosh* before Him. But we have to pay attention to please our Creator, and to offer it (*Kadosh*) to Him as sweet savor. And thus He spoke to them: 'Blessed be ye, O Yorde Mercabah, to heaven and to earth, if you will tell and announce to My sons what I am doing at morning and afternoon services, at the time when ye say *Kadosh* before me. Teach them and tell them: "Lift up your eyes to heaven, toward your celestial prayer-house, at the time when you speak *Kadosh* before Me." For I have no greater delight in My world than at the time when your eyes are raised to Mine, and My eyes look into yours, at the time when you say *Kadosh* before Me: for the voice which comes out of your throat at that time is well ordered, and rises before Me like sweet savor. Give also testimony to them of what I do, as you see, to the figure of your father Jacob, which is engraven in the throne of My glory; for at that time when you speak *Kadosh* before Me, I bend over it, caress, kiss, and embrace it, put My hands on his arms, three times, as often as you say *Kadosh* before Me, as it is written: "Holy, holy, holy is the Lord of hosts, the whole earth is full of His glory."'" (Is. vi. 3.)

³¹ Mk. i. 35.