

## MARTYRS' MILK.

(MIRACULUM: LAC PRO SANGUINE.)

BY PHILLIPS BARRY.

AMONG the legends of the early church, it is recorded of certain martyrs that when they were tortured or slain with the sword their wounds would shed milk, sometimes with blood. With a study of this miracle, as found in texts from the fourth century on together with certain related aspects of the martyr-cult, the following essay will deal. At the outset the documents may be put in evidence.

1. St. Paul (Coptic text, c. 375): "Und als man ihn am zweiten Tybi enthauptete, gieng aus ihm Milch hervor."<sup>1</sup>

2. St. Romanus (Prudentius, c. 404):

"Vix haec profatus pusionem praecipit  
sublime tollant. . . .

tenerumque duris ictibus tergum secent,  
plus unde lactis quam cruoris defluat."<sup>2</sup>

3. St. Sophia (Syriac text, fifth century): "And when the breasts of the maiden had been cut off. . . .the places from which they had been cut off flowed with milk instead of with blood."<sup>3</sup>

4. St. Pantaleon (Coptic text, c. 400-600): "Then all his body became white like snow, and instead of blood, milk issued."<sup>4</sup>

5. St. George (Coptic text, c. 400-600): "And they took off his holy head, and there came forth water and milk."<sup>5</sup>

6. St. Anub (Coptic text, c. 400-600): "A headsman came. . . . and severed his neck,—blood and milk issued therefrom."<sup>6</sup>

<sup>1</sup> O. v. Lemm, "Koptische Apokryphe Apostelakten," *Bull. de l'Acad. Imp. . . . de St. Petersbourg*, XXXV, p. 308-9.

<sup>2</sup> *Pristephanon*, X, 695ff.

<sup>3</sup> A. S. Lewis, *Select Narratives of Holy Women*, p. 174.

<sup>4</sup> F. Rossi, *Memorie della R. Acad. dei Lincei*, Ser. 5, 1893, pp. 1-136. This citation on p. 120.

<sup>5</sup> E. A. W. Budge, *St. George of Cappadocia*, "The Martyrdom of St. George," p. 235.

<sup>6</sup> I. Balestri and H. Hyvernat, *Scriptores Coptici*, Ser. 3, Vol. I, p. 240.

7. St. Epime (Coptic text, c. 400-600): "...they cut off his blessed head. Blood and milk flowed from his body."<sup>7</sup>

8. St. Isaac (Coptic text, c. 400-600): "...they... cut off his holy head... And there came forth blood and milk."<sup>8</sup>

9. St. Sarapamon (Coptic text, c. 400-600): "When Orion the guardsman cut off his head, water and milk flowed."<sup>9</sup>

10. St. Godeleva (1078): "Quo fiebat ut sacer sanguis qui poenae violentia in guttur confluxerat, in aquam de ore profusus, coagulatus in lapidem album, instar calcis induratus sit."<sup>10</sup>

Of the above texts, the Coptic Martyrdom of St. Paul, in a fourth century papyrus,<sup>11</sup> contains the earliest record of the miracle. Macarius Magnes, (c. 370) attests the story as current of St. Paul;<sup>12</sup> it is found also in the Greek, Latin, Arabic and Ethiopic texts of the Martyrdom,—of which the Greek, from a manuscript of the ninth century, (than which none is earlier) may be cited.

“ὡς δὲ ἀπεινάξεν αὐτοῦ ὁ σπεκουλάτωρ τὴν κεφαλὴν, γάλα ἐπύτισεν εἰς τοὺς χιτῶνας τοῦ στρατιώτου.”<sup>13</sup>

The martyr-cult, a tribute of the church to latent polytheism, early reached in Egypt a high development. Shenute, bishop of Atripe (333-451), saw in it a menace of social demoralization, even the decay of the church itself;<sup>14</sup> he denounced the worship of dead men's bones,<sup>15</sup> pious frauds, the toll of caves and old ruins, attested by relic-mongers' false revelations.<sup>16</sup> Then the dream oracles and healing cults were revived.<sup>17</sup> In the traditions of the saints, lived on the mythology and folk-lore of the old gods. Ser-

<sup>7</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 154.

<sup>8</sup> E. A. W. Budge, "The Martyrdom of St. Isaac of Tiphre," *Trans. Soc. Bib. Arch.*, IX, p. 89.

<sup>9</sup> H. Hyvernat, *Les Actes des Martyres de l'Égypte*, p. 330.

<sup>10</sup> *Acta Sanct.*, 6 Jul., II, p. 431, "Vita S. Godelevae," 77.

<sup>11</sup> O. v. Lemm, *loc. cit.*, p. 237.

<sup>12</sup> "ὁ μὲν γὰρ τῆς κεφαλῆς τμηθεὶς, αἵματι καὶ γάλακτι τὸν ὄφιν εἰς λιχνηίαν ὡσπερ ἐδελέασεν." (*Apocriticus*, IV, 14, p. 182, Blondel.)

<sup>13</sup> R. A. Lipsius and M. Bonnet, *Acta Apostolorum Apocrypha*, I, 115.

<sup>14</sup> G. Zoega, *Catalogus Codicum Coptiorum*, p. 421: "Sermo de ecclesiis omni tempore et omni die frequentandis in timore Dei."

<sup>15</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 424 (Title of a sermon by Shenute): "Exegesis annexa iis quae diximus et scripsimus de iis qui venerantur ossa mortuorum vano nomine eas appellantes ossa martyrum."

<sup>16</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 424: "Sunt qui ajunt martyres apparuerunt nobis et dixerunt quod ossa sua certo loco condita essent, quos deprehendi et convicti de errore suo. Nonnulli dum aedes demoliuntur vel lapides caedunt, si inierint edificiorum subterraneorum formas et capsulas, ajunt quod martyres sunt. Anne in capsis sepeliverunt homines praeter eos qui martyrium sustinuerunt?" (Extract from a sermon by Shenute.)

<sup>17</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 424 (Shenute): "Loquitur... de aegrotis qui somnum capiunt in locis martyrum, quo salutem recipiant, aut somnio moneantur."

vice in the interest of the martyrs.—building of shrines, writing of memorials, was a work of supererogation.<sup>18</sup> And, in spite of abuses, drinking and merrymaking, gambling, lewdness and brawling, rife among the crowds at the shrines, the cult endured,—since it made more easy, the transition from the old faith to the new.<sup>19</sup>

Contemporaneous with the development of the martyr-cult was the rise of another by-product of ecclesiastical evolution, the hagiographic romance. Of this literary genre, Egypt, the land of the folk-tale,<sup>20</sup> has left us the best examples in the Coptic writings. Its development was intimately connected with the history of the church. In the pre-Constantinian period of local or general persecution, the saints were witness of the psychic impetus of Christianity,—their records, relatively free from mythology, forming a logical supplement to the apostolic tradition.<sup>21</sup> With the triumph of the church, however, when the witness of the martyrs was no longer a vital issue, the absorption of pagan elements followed. The memorials of the martyrs, the heroes of the church,<sup>22</sup> were historical novels, wherein fancy ran light footed, if history feared to tread. In Egypt the hagiographic romance circulated early,—witness the mute testimony of papyri of the fifth century lately found at Oxyrhynchus, with portions of the memorials of St. Paphnute and of St. Christina, written in vulgar Greek.<sup>23</sup> Of the extant Coptic texts, those in Sahidic were written between 400 and

<sup>18</sup> E. O. Winstedt, *Coptic Texts relating to St. Theodore*, "Apa Chamoul," p. 206: "And those that shall write my martyrdom tear up the copy of their sins."

<sup>19</sup> G. Zoega, *loc. cit.*, p. 423: "Si quis cum dulci miscuerit quod omni felle amarius est, num biberes o homo? Adire loca martyrum, ut ores, legas, psallas, sanctifices te, et sumas eucharistiam in timore Dei, bonum est. At ibi concinere, edere, bibere, ludere, magis adhuc fornicari, homicidia committere per ebrietatem. . . iniquitas est." (Shenute.)

<sup>20</sup> J. Leipoldt, *Geschichte der koptischen Litteratur*, p. 142: "Die Lust am Fabulieren ist ihnen sozusagen angeboren,—das beweisen die Märchenbücher, die uns aus den Jahrtausenden vor Christus erhalten sind."

<sup>21</sup> A. Harnack, "Martyrer- und Heilungsakten," *Sitzber. der kön. Preuss. Akad.*, 1910, 117: "Wie sich der Märtyrer benommen hat. . . sein Christus-bekenntnis, endlich was Christus an ihm manifestiert hat, das war der Gegenstand des höchsten Interesses, denn es gehörte auf dasselbe Niveau, auf welchem das neue Testament stand."

<sup>22</sup> Augustine, *De Civ. Dei*, X, 21: "Hos. . . nostros heroes vocaremus. . . quod daemones. . . vincerent."

<sup>23</sup> *Pubblicazioni della Societa Italiana per la Ricerca dei Papiri Greci e Latini in Egitto*, Vol. I, Nos. 26, 27. A Coptic text of the martyrdom of St. Paphnute must have preceded the Greek text of the Oxyrhynchus papyrus, since in the papyrus the martyr is called "Απα Παπνούριος, in which "Απα is Coptic *apa*, the generic word for a saint or holy man. As far as it goes, the text of the papyrus corresponds exactly with the text of the Bohairic "Martyrdom of St. Paphnute."

600 A. D.,<sup>24</sup> those in Boheric are mostly translations from Sahidic.<sup>25</sup> From linguistic evidence, however, comes the proof that this type of literature, the successor of the native folk-tale, goes back in Egypt to the fourth century.

A time-honored punishment for slaves or criminals was by the rack, or "wooden horse" (Greek ξύλον, Latin *equuleus*). Eusebius and Prudentius testify of its use against the Christians.<sup>26</sup> In Coptic hagiographs, torture by the rack, (*hermetarion*, Sah.; *ermetarion*, Boh..) is a commonplace,<sup>27</sup> the victims being women as well as men. This word *hermetarion* was a local word in Egypt, according to St. Athanasius who wrote in the year 357, current during the period of Arian atrocities in the Thebaid.

“ἀλλὰ νῦν οἱ θαυμαστοὶ Ἀρειανοὶ, οἱ καὶ ἡμᾶς διαβάλλοντες. . . ταύτας γυμνώσαντες ἐποίησαν ἐπὶ τῶν καλουμένων ἐρμηταρίων κρεμασθῆναι, . . . οὐδὲ γὰρ οὐδὲ ἐν τοῖς γενομένοις διωγμοῖς τοιοῦτον ἠκούσθη πραχθέν. . . μόνοις γὰρ αἰρετικοῖς οἰκεῖον. . . πλημμελεῖν κατὰ τῶν ἀγίων. . . παρθένων.”<sup>28</sup>

Writing at white heat, he denies that Christian women were thus tortured by the imperial governors. In the Coptic Martyrdom of St. Justus, however, the scene of which is laid in the time of Diocletian, a girl-child is racked by Arianus, governor of the Thebaid.<sup>29</sup> History knows no such person: the governor under Diocletian was Clodius Culcianus, as attested by a papyrus of the year 303,<sup>30</sup> also by Eusebius,<sup>31</sup> and one Coptic Martyrdom of St.

<sup>24</sup> J. Leipoldt, *Geschichte der koptischen Litteratur*, p. 156: "Die mönchische Litteratur der saïdischen Mundart war noch vor der persischen (619) und arabischen Eroberung (641), auf einem toten Punkte angekommen."

<sup>25</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 144, footnote 3: "Die bohairischen Martyrien sind grösstenteils aus den saïdischen übersetzt."

<sup>26</sup> Eusebius, VIII, 10: "οἱ μὲν γὰρ ὀπίσω τῷ χεῖρε δεθέντες, περὶ τὸ ξύλον ἐξηρτῶντο, καὶ μαργάνοις τισὶ διετίνοντο πᾶν μέλος."

Prudentius, *Peristephanon*, X, 108-9.

"Incensus his Asclepiades iusserat  
Eviscerandum corpus eculco."

<sup>27</sup> In these texts, the rack is one of the first tortures used,—at the instigation of the governor, when the martyrs' obstinacy or evasive replies have enraged him. See E. O. Winstedt, *Coptic Texts relating to St. Theodore*, "Apa Chamoul," p. 201. "And the governor was wroth, and he bade them hang him to the rack (*ἐρμητάριον*)."

<sup>28</sup> Athanasius, *Apologia ad Constantium*, Migne, P. G., XXV, col. 640.

<sup>29</sup> E. O. Winstedt, *Coptic Texts relating to St. Theodore*, p. 218: "He made them place her upon the rack (*hermetarion*), and scrape her till her ribs flowed with blood."

<sup>30</sup> *The Oxyrhynchus Papyri*, Vol. I, 132-3: "Κλωδίωι Κουλκιάνωι τῶι. . . ἐπάρχωι Αἰγύπτου."

<sup>31</sup> Eusebius, *Hist. Eccl.*, IX, 11.

Theodore.<sup>32</sup> By these data, the writing of hagiographic romances by the Copts is attested for a period when the memory of Arian atrocities was yet fresh. In the name of the unhistorical Arianus, the hated Arians are gibbeted.<sup>33</sup> The word *hermetarion*, etymologically a corruption of Latin *armentarium*, as actually stated in an early Greco-Latin gloss,

*armentarium*      ξυλον      ερμηταριον<sup>34</sup>

is derived from the neuter form of the nickname Armentarius, borne by the emperor Galerius Maximianus.<sup>35</sup> As Greek ἀρμεντάριον it is found in the Acts of SS. Ciryus and Julitta.<sup>36</sup>

σχετλιάσαντος δὲ ἐπὶ τοῦτο τοῦ δικαστοῦ, κελεύει ἀρμενταρίω ἀναρτηθεῖσαν εὐτόνωσ ξέεσθαι.

Evidence of Egyptian influence is further to be found in the fund of miraculous stories which swell the hagiographic tradition. For the purpose of the present essay may be considered a remarkable and widespread belief, namely, the restoration to life of dead men and animals by reassembling their scattered members. In its oldest form, an incident in the myth of Osiris, it is found in the Pyramid Texts, according to which the deceased king, identified with Osiris, was reanimated by the magical symbolism of dismemberment and integration. In witness whereof are the following documents.

1. Teti (c. 2600 B. C.)<sup>37</sup>: "Nephthys has collected for thee all thy members, in her name, 'Our Lady the Assembler.'"

2. Teti<sup>38</sup>: "Hail, hail, rise thou, Teti! Thou hast grasped thy head, thou has brought thy bones, thou hast collected thy members."

<sup>32</sup> E. O. Winstedt, *loc. cit.*, p. 162. Culcianus appears in other Coptic stories.

<sup>33</sup> Yet such are the vicissitudes of sainthood! Arianus himself entered later into the cycle of conscience-stricken persecutors, as a professing Christian and martyr. (F. Rossi, *Memorie della R. Accad. dei Lincei*, Ser. V, 1893, a Coptic text of the martyrdom of St. Arianus.) His body, thrown into the sea, is brought back by a dolphin, perhaps a reminiscence of the classic legend of Arion.

<sup>34</sup> *C. G. L.*, II, 25, 31. *Cod. Par.*, 7651, of the ninth century.

<sup>35</sup> Aur. Vict., *De Caes.*, XXXIX, (c. 360): "Galerium Maximianum, cui cognomen Armentario erat. . . ." Cf. also, *ibid.* XL.

Pseudo-Aurelius, *Epit.* XL (written c. 400): "Galerius autem. . . ortus parentibus agrariis, pastor armentorum, unde ei cognomen Armentario fuit."

<sup>36</sup> *Analecta Bollandiana*, I, 198. "Acta Graeca Sincera SS. Ciryi et Iulittae." This document is cited exactly by Theodore of Iconium, (c. 1005) and must be earlier than 551, since it appears in the *index expurgatorius* of the Gelasian Decree, which Dobschütz assigns to the period 518-551.

<sup>37</sup> K. Sethe, *Die altägyptischen Pyramidentexte*, 616.

<sup>38</sup> *Ibid.*, 654.

3. Teti<sup>39</sup>: "Thou hast bound thy head to thy bones, thou hast bound thy bones to thy head."

4. Pepi I (c. 2575 B. C.)<sup>40</sup>: "Pepi has united his bones, he has gathered his members."

5. Pepi I<sup>41</sup>: "Hail, Pepi! Thou hast brought thy bones, thou hast received thy head before Seb."

6. Pepi I<sup>42</sup>: "She gives thee thy head, she unites thee thy bones, she joins thy members, she puts thy heart in thy body."

7. Pepi II (c. 2475 B. C.)<sup>43</sup>: "Isis offers thy libation, Nephthys has made thee pure,—thy two sisters mighty and great, collecting thy flesh, joining thy members."

This belief, native for thirty centuries to Egypt, passed into popular Christianity, Christ and the Angels taking the places of Horus and Nephthys.

1. St. Lacaron: "Sumpsit membra beati, invicem compegit ea, suscitavitque eum iterum."<sup>44</sup>

2. St. Anub: "Tunc Archangelus Michael, deorsum de caelo venit, Suriele et Raphaelae cum eo ambulantes. Apprehenderunt membra corporis eius, ea invicem coniunxerunt, et exsufflarunt in faciem iusti, qui surrexit incorruptus."<sup>45</sup>

3. St. George: "When he had finished his prayer, and had said 'Amen,' they threw him on the wheel, and . . . immediately his body was broken into ten pieces. . . . And the dragon of the abyss (i. e., Dadianus) commanded them to throw his bones. . . . into a dry pit . . . Michael went down into the pit, and put together the holy body of St. George. . . . and the Lord breathed upon his face and filled him again with life, and He embraced him."<sup>46</sup>

Likewise the reanimation of dead animals, the earliest legend of which appears in the Westcar Papyrus (c. 2000 B. C.),<sup>47</sup> is an incident in the hagiographs.

<sup>39</sup> *Ibid.*, 572.

<sup>40</sup> *Ibid.*, 980.

<sup>41</sup> *Ibid.*, 840.

<sup>42</sup> *Ibid.*, 835.

<sup>43</sup> *Ibid.*, 1981.

<sup>44</sup> I. Balestri and H. Hyvernat, *Scriptores Coptici*, Ser. 3, Vol. I, p. 14.

<sup>45</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 221.

<sup>46</sup> E. A. W. Budge, *St. George of Cappadocia*, "The Martyrdom of St. George," p. 212.

<sup>47</sup> W. M. Flinders Petrie, *Egyptian Tales*, p. 28: "And his majesty said, 'Is it true, that which men say, that thou canst restore the head which is smitten off?' And Dedi replied, 'Truly I know that, O King, (life, wealth and health) my Lord!' And his majesty said, 'Let one bring me a prisoner who is in prison, that his punishment may be fulfilled.' And Dedi said, 'Let it not be a man, O King, my Lord,—behold, we do not even thus to our cattle.'

St. Lacaron: "Cum haec dixisset B. Apa Lacaron, calceamentum quod erat in pede praesidis, factus est sicut vitulus, coram praeside et universa turba."<sup>48</sup>

In the tradition of the Latin church the myth of dismemberment and magical restoration is of frequent record. The following documents will illustrate the forms in which it is found.

1. St. Patrick: "Ailill's wife went to the hill on which they were biding and said, 'Swine have devoured our son, O Ailill!' saith she, 'through their brutishness.' And Ailill said to Patrick: 'I will believe, if thou bringest my son to life again for me.' Patrick ordered the bones of the son to be gathered together, and directed a Culdee of his household, namely, Malach the Briton. . . . 'I will not tempt the Lord,' saith Malach. . . . Thereafter Patrick ordered the bishop Ibar and Ailbe to bring the boy to life, and he besought the Lord along with them. The boy was brought back to life after this, through Patrick's prayer."<sup>49</sup>

2. St. Kiaran: "In illa hora videns pius puer lupum miserum et macerum et esurientem ad se venientem, famulus Dei dixit ei, 'vade miser, et commede illum vitulum.'" Et devoravit eum. . . . Sanctus Kiaranus. . . ossa eius in sinum suum collegit, et reddiens deposuit ea ante vaccam plorantem. Et statim divina pietate propter sanctitatem pueri vitulus coram omnibus surrexit."<sup>50</sup>

3. St. Winifred: "Then tooke Benoe the heade, and sett it agayne to the bodie, and covered it with his mantel, and went to his masse. And beholde when he had sounged and preachte to the people much of the mayden, he sayd, God would not that she should be deade. . . . Wherefore he bad manie men and weomen to pray to God to rayse her agayne to lyfe, and so he did. And when she sate up, with her hande she wipte away the dust from her face that was thereon, and spake to them whole and sounde as she was before."<sup>51</sup>

This legend of St. Winifred is of interest for the reason that it is doubtless but a reminiscence of an incident in the martyrdom of

And a duck was brought to him and its head was cut off. And the duck was laid on the west side of the hall, and its head on the east side of the hall. And Dedi spake his magic speech. And the duck fluttered along the ground, and its head came likewise, and when it had come part to part, the duck stood and quacked." (The same miracle is wrought on a goose and an ox.)

<sup>48</sup> I. Balestri and H. Hyvernath, *Scriptores Coptici*, Ser. 3, Vol. I, p. 16. Cf. "Acta Apocrypha SS. Ciryaci et Iulittae," *Acta Sancti.*, 16 June, III, 31.

<sup>49</sup> W. Stokes, *Tripartite Life of St. Patrick*, p. 198.

<sup>50</sup> "Vita S. Ciarani de Cluain," v. Plummer, *Vitae Sanctorum Hiberniae*, Vol. I, p. 202. The hagiography is doubtless the origin of a similar story in the Edda. See B. Thorpe, *Northern Mythology*, I, p. 57.

<sup>51</sup> *Anal. Boll.*, VI, 308, "The Lyfe of St. Wenefreide" (c. 1401).

St. George. "They rose up together, and joined the head of the saint to his body and it united with it, as if it had never been severed at all."<sup>52</sup>

Of all hagiographs, the miraculous history of St. George has had an influence second to none. One disguised version of it passes as the biography of St. Catherine, another as the history of St. Martina. Both of these texts retain the incident of the milk-shedding wounds.

1. St. Catherine: "ἀντὶ τοῦ αἵματος γάλα ἔρυσεν ἐπὶ τῆς γῆς."<sup>53</sup>

2. St. Martina: "Inciso autem corpore eius, emanabat lac pro sanguine."<sup>54</sup>

Such transference of legends of different saints is not unusual, —the most notable instance, however, is to be observed in the case of St. Aemilianus, patron of Trerri in Umbria, the legend of St. Aemilianus being nothing less than the legend of St. Pantaleon taken over bodily.<sup>55</sup>

To return to the main subject of our essay. The incident of the milk-shedding wounds appears besides in a number of hagiographs, the same being here put in evidence.<sup>56</sup>

<sup>52</sup> E. A. W. Budge, *St. George of Cappadocia*, "The Encomium by St. Theodosius," p. 237. Cf. Pyr. 572.

<sup>53</sup> J. Viteau, *Passions des Saints Ecaterine, Pierre d'Alexandrie*, etc., p. 23.

<sup>54</sup> *Acta Sanct.*, 1 Jan., I, 13.

<sup>55</sup> Of St. Aemilianus two closely related accounts are given in the *Acta Sanctorum*, viz., 28 Jan., II, 833, from F. Ferrari, who claimed to have read the Acts of St. Aemilianus at Spoleto, and 8 Feb., II, 158, a Latin version of an Italian life by one Iacobillus, who cited biographies of St. Aemilianus, published at Trerri, 1592, 1593, but these could not be found by Bolland. That the legend is but the legend of St. Pantaleon, with the name, locality, and a few minor details changed, the following parallel summaries of the two will declare:

I. St. Pantaleon,

1. Accused before Maximian by the doctors' guild.
2. Offers test: heals a paralytic in the name of Christ.
3. Tortured: rack, fire, lead, thrown in sea with millstone, to beasts, by wheel which kills 500 men.
4. Bound to olive: neck grows hard, headsman's sword-like wax.
5. Decapitated: wounds shed milk, olive-tree fruits.

II. St. Aemilianus,

1. Accused before Maximian by the priests of Æsculapius.
2. Offers test: heals a paralytic in the name of Christ.
3. Tortured: rack, fire, lead, thrown into the river Clitumnus with a millstone, to beasts, by wheel which kills 500 men.
4. Bound to olive: headsman's sword like wax.
5. Decapitated: wounds shed milk, olive-tree fruits.

The account of the miracle of the milk-shedding wounds: "Ex cuius corpore lac pro sanguine fluxisse arboresque flores et fructus emisisse ferunt." (*Acta Sanct.*, 28 Jan., II, 833.)

<sup>56</sup> St. Maeruan of Tallaght had blood of a pale color, due to ascetic habits. See S. Baring Gould, *The Lives of the British Saints*, III, 454.

1. St. Acacius:<sup>57</sup>

“τραχήλον Ἀκάκιος ἐκτμηθεὶς ξίφει,  
Ψυχῆς τὸ λευκὸν μηνύων βλύζει γάλα.”

2. St. Antiochus:<sup>58</sup>

“Ἀντίοχος . . . ἰατρὸς τὴν τεχνὴν . . . ἀπετμήθη τὴν κεφαλὴν, καὶ ἔρρου-  
σεν ἐκ τοῦ τραχήλου αὐτοῦ σὺν αἵματι γάλα.”

3. St. Blasius:<sup>59</sup>

“Videbant autem milites illi quod pro sanguine lac carnes earum  
stillabant.”

4. SS. Cantiani:<sup>60</sup>

“Ecce sanguis eorum, tamquam lac, omnibus videntibus ap-  
paruit.”

5. St. Christina:<sup>61</sup>

“Iulianus ira commotus, iussit mamillas eius abscindere. Chris-  
tina dixit,— . . . vide quia pro sanguine lac . . . defluxit.”

6. St. Cyprilla:<sup>62</sup>

“Vulneribus sanguis, e papillis vero lac instar fluminis de-  
fluxerit.”

7. St. Euppsychius:<sup>63</sup>

“Nam loco sanguinis, dum caput eius abscinderetur, effluxit  
lac et aqua.”

8. St. Mennigus:<sup>64</sup>

“E vestigio igitur articulos ad usque metacarpion resecant, qui  
pro sanguine lacteum liquorem profudere.”

9. St. Pompeius:<sup>65</sup>

“ὡς ζῶν πρόβατον, Πομπήιμ, τοῦ Κυρίου,  
χεῖς ἀμελχθεὶς ἀχένα ξίφει γάλα.”

10. St. Quintinus:<sup>66</sup>

“At illi abstracto gladio caput eius amputaverunt, et sanguis  
statim de collo eius candidus tamquam nix.”

<sup>57</sup> *Acta Sanct.*, 28 July, VI, 547.

<sup>58</sup> “Synaxarium Basilianum,” July 15. See *Acta Sant.*, Jul., I, 693.

<sup>59</sup> *Acta Sanct.*, 3 Feb., I, 338.

<sup>60</sup> B. Mombritius, *Sanctuarium*, I, 279, 51.

<sup>61</sup> *Acta Sanct.*, 24 July, V, 528.

<sup>62</sup> *Acta Sanct.*, 5 July, II, 224 (from the Greek).

<sup>63</sup> *Acta Sanct.*, 9 April, I, 823 (from the hymns of Joseph the Hymnograph). See also *Acta Sanct.*, 7 Sept., III, 6: “καὶ αὐτίκα ἀντὶ αἵματος γάλα καὶ ὕδωρ ἔγγνε” (from a Constantinople Synaxary). These two legends are different versions of the same story, perhaps colored by the legend of St. George.

<sup>64</sup> *Acta Sanct.*, 15 Mar., II, 391 (ex recuso Sanctorum Viridario Mattaei Raderi).

<sup>65</sup> *Acta Sanct.*, 5 Apr. I, 399. From Maximus of Cythera.

<sup>66</sup> B. Mombritius, *Sanctuarium*, II, 427, 38.

11. St. Secundina :<sup>67</sup>

"Illud etiam mirabile contigisse fertur, quod pro sanguine ex eius corpore lacero lac profluxit."

12. SS. Victor and Corona :<sup>68</sup>

"Itaque sicut iussum fuerat, decollatus est, et de colli eius vulnere lac et sanguis profluxit."

Of these the legend of St. Christina circulated in Egypt during the fifth century.<sup>69</sup> In connection with the cult of St. Pantaleon, the patron saint of physicians, particular importance was attached to the characteristic miracle of his legend.<sup>70</sup> A vessel said to contain the identical blood and milk of his martyrdom existed in the ninth century.<sup>71</sup> A thirteenth century document makes of this vessel a curious "war barometer," in which the milk and blood, separated by gravity, exchanged positions every year, save that during a year of war the blood remained uppermost.<sup>72</sup>

In the Coptic "Martyrdom of St. Isaac" the hagiographer records miracles of healing by the blood and milk which flowed from the martyr's wounds:<sup>73</sup> "Now when the blind and the lame, and the deaf and the dumb had taken of that same blood and milk which came forth from the body of the blessed man, and laid it

<sup>67</sup> F. Ferrari, "Catalogus Sanctorum," in *Acta Sanct.*, Jan. 1, 997.

<sup>68</sup> *Analecta Bollandiana*, II, 299. St. Victor was martyred at Kome in Egypt; the whole story bears evidence of Egyptian origin.

<sup>69</sup> See p. 4. The text of the Bollandist account is close to that of the Oxyrhynchus papyrus.

<sup>70</sup> Verses for the office on St. Pantaleon's day:

"γαλατόμικτον Μάρτυς αἶμα σῆς κάρας,  
δι' ἣν ὑδατόμικτον ὁ Χριστὸς χέει,  
φάσγανον ἐβδομάτηι εἶλαχ' εἰκαδι Πανταλεήμων."

<sup>71</sup> "Synaxarium Basilianum," in *Acta Sanct.*, July I, p. 697: "Καὶ ἀποτμηθεὶς τὴν κεφαλὴν, ἔρρουσεν αἶμα καὶ γάλα, ὅπερ μέχρι τῆς σήμερον φαινόμενον παρέχει τοῖς προσερχομένοις πᾶσι πιστοῖς ἰάματα."

<sup>72</sup> *Acta Sanct.*, July VI, 421, "Miracula S. Pantaleonis," 2: "In eadem namque urbe sanguis huius gloriosi martyris Christi in ampulla perlucida, magnae, ut dignum est, venerationi habetur,—discolor, id est, candidus et rubicundus, . . . partim candidum lac, partim rubicundus sanguis. Servant haec duo mirabiliter iussas a Domino suae positionis annuas vicissitudines ita videlicet, ut si praecedente anno, rubicundus superius parebat, anni sequentis initio descendat et superius appareat candidum lac, descensurum nihilominus anno redeunte, ut superne fulgeat pretiosa sanguinis gloriosi purpura. Fere nunquam haec alternatio cessat. . . . Semel tantum nostra memoria, regnante Michaele imperatore, qui nuper decessit, cessasse perhibetur haec descensionis alternatio, ut vice sua non descenderet sanguis, sed permaneret superior anno toto sequente, ut fuerat anno praecedente. Fuit autem annus idem totus praeliorum sanguine cruentus."

<sup>73</sup> E. A. W. Budge, "The Martyrdom of St. Isaac of Tiphre," *Trans. Soc. Bib. Arch.*, IX, 89.

upon their diseased members, behold, they were healed immediately."

Of St. Pantaleon also, similar miracles of healing are reported.<sup>74</sup> Now in Egypt, the land of medical lore and the home of methods in therapeutics that dominated the practice of medicine down to comparatively recent times,<sup>75</sup> it was early taught that human milk had curative powers. In the Ebers Papyrus, the "milk of a woman who had borne a male child," is indicated for treatment of sore eyes.<sup>76</sup> This recipe passed into the Latin hagiographic tradition.

1. St. Remigius:<sup>77</sup> "Scias cum ablactaveris puerum Remigium, de lacte tuo perunges oculos meos, et recipiam lumen. . . . Et ablactatus, . . . lacte matris oculos sui vatis. . . . perungens, lumen illi gratia divina restituit."

2. St. Mochoemog:<sup>78</sup> "Non poteris sanitatem oculorum invenire tuorum, nisi oculos et faciem tuam laveris lacte uberum uxoris Beoani artificis, quae enim nunquam peperit, sed dono Dei sanctum habet in utero conceptum. . . . Lavans igitur lacte uberum B. Nessae sanctus, uxoris Beoani artificis, oculos suos, ibi illico lumen recepit suum."

In the hagiography, also, a belief is current that water<sup>79</sup> in which a saint has washed was a veritable panacea.<sup>80</sup> A typical instance is recorded in the Arabic Gospel of the Infancy:<sup>81</sup> "Postero die eadem mulier aquam odoratam sumpsit ut Dominum Jesum lavaret, quo loto aquam illam qua id fecerat recepit, eiusque partem

<sup>74</sup> See note 71.

<sup>75</sup> G. Ebers, "Wie Altägyptisches in die europäische Volksmedizin gelangte," *Zeitschrift für ägypt. Sprache*, XXXIII, 18: "Hier kam es nur darauf an, zu zeigen, dass sich Altägyptisches in der mittelalterlichen Medizin findet, und dass es über Salerno nach Mitteleuropa kam. Zu den Salernitanischen Meistern war es theils durch Griechen, die ihre Schriften damit bereichert hatten, grösstentheils aber durch Uebersetzungen altägyptischer medicinischer Texte ins Koptische und vielleicht auch ins Griechische gelangt, die die Araber schon früh in ihre Sprache übertrugen."

<sup>76</sup> G. Ebers, *loc. cit.*, XXXVIII, 10, footnote.

<sup>77</sup> *Acta Sanct.*, I Oct., I, 135.

<sup>78</sup> C. Plummer, *Vitae Sanctorum Hiberniae*, II, p. 165.

<sup>79</sup> In the martyrdom of St. George, the magician Athanasius washes his face in one of the philtres he offers St. George. See E. A. W. Budge, *St. George of Cappadocia*, "The Martyrdom of St. George," p. 210.

<sup>80</sup> E. Amelineau (*Annales du Musée Guimet*) *Vie de St. Jean Kolobos*, p. 338. In the *Acta Sanctorum* the cases run into hundreds,—water in which a saint's clothes or relics had been washed; even water in which a saint had washed a leper's sores had the same virtue.

<sup>81</sup> C. Tischendorf, *Evangelia Apocrypha*, p. 188, sect. XVII. Compare also sect. XXVIII. In sect. XXXI, a dying child is restored to health by being placed in the bed of Jesus.

in puellam ibi habitantem, cuius corpus lepra album erat, effudit, illamque ea lavit, quo facto, puella statim a lepra purgatus est." Of this belief, likewise, the earliest intimation is in the Pyramid Texts<sup>82</sup> (Pepi II, 2475 B. C.): "A bowl of cool water before the door of this Neferkare,—every god washes his face in it! Thou washest thy hands, Osiris, thou washest thy hands, Neferkare, thou renewest thyself!"

Still another legend of which Egyptian origin is traceable, and which passed into the hagiography, may be noticed in passing: namely, the effect of martyr's milk and blood on plant life. The earliest record is in the *Tale of the Two Brothers*,<sup>83</sup> in which the blood of the slain Bata, falling on a door-post, transforms it into a persea-tree.<sup>84</sup> In the Coptic Martyrdom of St. Pantaleon, it is recorded that when milk and blood flowed from his wound, "the olive-tree to which he was bound, became loaded with fruit."<sup>85</sup> A Greek text has a similar story of St. Therapon of Said:<sup>86</sup>

“ἀπλώθεις καταξέεται ράβδους τὰς σάρκας, καὶ πιανθείσα ἡ γῆ τῶι αἵματι αὐτοῦ φυτὸν βαλάνου ἀνέδωκε μεγιστὸν λίαν, ὃ μέχρι τῆς σημέρον δείκνυται ἀίφυλλον ὃν πᾶσαν νόσον καὶ πᾶσαν μαλακίαν ἰώμενον.”

It remains now to trace the possible origin of the legend that the wounds of martyrs shed milk for blood, and the significance of this belief for the development of the idea of sainthood.<sup>87</sup> As has been pointed out, the earliest record is in the Coptic Martyrdom of St. Paul,<sup>88</sup> that it is a bit of the marvel-lore of Egypt is at least probable. Yet as legends of this sort do not originate out of nothing, it must not be thought impossible to discover a historical background for any story, however far removed into the realm of the fantastic. In the case of the miracles of levitation by solar rays and resuscitation by reassembling a dismembered body, the etiology resolves itself into a case of literalization of types of religious symbolism. In the present instance, the miracle had its

<sup>82</sup> K. Sethe. *Die altägyptischen Pyramidentexte*, 2068.

<sup>83</sup> From a papyrus of Seti II (19th Dynasty).

<sup>84</sup> *Records of the Past*, Vol. II, "Egyptian Texts," p. 150.

<sup>85</sup> F. Rossi, *loc. cit.* (see note 4).

<sup>86</sup> *Acta Sanct.*, 27 May, VI, 680.

<sup>87</sup> Sainthood in general was an extension of the martyr-cult. It conveyed with it the connotation of a type of life in which the experiences of the senses and the reason no longer constituted valid criteria for the truth. See my article "Saints and Sainthood," *The Open Court*, Jan. 1914, pp. 46-57.

<sup>88</sup> This fact is not rendered less significant by the evidence that Greek was the original language: the Copts never were mere translators, but embellished as well. No assurance is forthcoming that our ninth century Greek text represents the original.

origin in certain physiological theories filtered down through the minds of ignorant monks whose ideas were dominated by *die Lust zu fabulieren*.

The medical writers, from Hippocrates to Galen, who drew at least some of their information from Egyptian sources,<sup>89</sup> held to a view of the intimate connection between blood and milk. According to Galen,<sup>90</sup> "Milk is developed from blood, undergoing a very slight change in the lactiferous glands." Hippocrates also believed in the existence of an abnormal condition, manifested in the secretion of milk by a *nullipara*.<sup>91</sup> Such a tradition obviously preceded the accounts of the several instances in which the mutilated breasts of a virgin were said to have yielded milk.<sup>92</sup>

It is but a little longer step to suppose a condition in which the blood of a man might be suddenly changed to milk, as in the case of St. Paul and others. That such a condition was believed to be obtainable in the case of male animals through magic, is attested by a passage in the life of St. Columba relative to milk obtained by magic from a bull.<sup>93</sup> "(maleficus) a sancto iussus, de bove masculino qui prope erat lac arte diabolica expressit. . . . Vir itaque beatus, vas, ut videbatur, tale plenum lacte, sibi ocus dari poposcit. . . . et continuo lacteus ille color in naturam versus est propriam, id est, in sanguinem."<sup>94</sup>

\* \* \*

The results of the foregoing investigation may now be summed up as follows:

1. The tradition that milk instead of blood flowed from the wounds of St. Paul and other martyrs, appears first in a Coptic text which goes back to the fourth century.

2. The martyr-cult, as Shenute testifies, became important in

<sup>89</sup> G. Ebers, "Wie Altägyptisches in die europäische Volksmedizin gelangte," *Zeit. für ägypt. Sprache*, XXXIII, 1.

<sup>90</sup> Galen, XV, p. 394 (ed. Kuhn): "ἐξ αἵματος δὲ καὶ ἡ τοῦ γάλακτος, ὡς εἶπον, γένεσις ἀλιγίστην μεταβολὴν ἐν μαστοῖς προσλαβόντος."

<sup>91</sup> Hippocrates, III, 744 (ed. Kuhn): "ἦν γύνη μὴ κύουσα, μηδὲ τεκοῦσα, γάλα ἔχουσα. . . ."

<sup>92</sup> Cf. St. Christina, St. Cyprilla, St. Sophia. The story of St. Sophia has been rewritten by Hrotsvitha, ("Sapientia," *Pat. Lat.*, CXXXVII, 1054): "*Fidēs: Inviolatum pectus vulnerasti, se me non laesisti; En pro fonte sanguinis fons erumpit lactis.*"

From the hagiography, the belief in maidens' milk passed into the popular tradition of Europe.

<sup>93</sup> *Acta Sanct.*, 9 Jun. II, 217. Written by Adamnanus Scotus, c. 704.

<sup>94</sup> Cf. *Acta Sanct.*, 8 May, II, 336 ("Miracula S. Petri Tarent.," 6) for a story of a cow that gave blood for milk till the animal was turned over to the monks.

Egypt during the fourth and fifth centuries, being one of the most significant expressions of popular Christianity.

3. The Egyptian type of hagiographic romance dates soon after the Arian atrocities in the Thebaid (c. 350) as shown by the use in Coptic of the word *hermetarion*, the word current among the Arians as the name of the rack, and also by the references to the torture of women by the unhistorical Roman governor, Arianus (i. e., Arian).

4. Egyptian stories entered into the hagiographic tradition,—witness the legend of the resuscitation by reassembling the parts of a dead body.

5. The origin of the miracle of martyrs' milk is to be traced to medical theories (perhaps Egyptian) of the development of milk from blood.