EMERSON'S GOETHE*

BY PETER HAGBOLDT
The University of Chicago

E MERSON'S Goethe developed slowly. A rather interesting but negative character in the beginning, he gained so much in Emerson's esteem that in *Representative Men* Goethe is called the "soul of his century." Three factors prevented Emerson from understanding Goethe readily and completely: linguistic difficulties; a strong prejudice against Goethe prevailing at the time in England, America, and even Germany; and a firm Puritan idealistic-moral attitude which Emerson upheld throughout his life.

A number of statements in letters and essays testify to his linguistic difficulties. In 1835 (Feb. 3) Carlyle advises Emerson to learn German in order to study mainly Goethe.1 Five years later Emerson informs Carlyle: "I have contrived to read almost every volume of Goethe, and I have fifty-five...."2 In 1858 (June 29) he assures Gisela von Arnim that he is "not a little proud to read German at all," and in July of the following year, "I am a bad travellerespecially as regards Germany, by a despair of talking in a language which I can only read, and not pronounce and much less speak."3 In 1861 (June 27) he writes to Grimm, "I read German with some ease and always better...." In the same letter he states that his daughter Ellen reads the letters of his German friends to him because "Ellen has facility and inclination to front and surmount the barriers of language and script." In the year 1871 we find Emerson on a trip to California reading Goethe's Sprüche in Prosa with the help of a little dictionary. In his Essay on Books,

*Read at the Goethe Centennial Celebration at the University of Chicago, March 8-9, 1932.

1The Correspondence of Thomas Carlyle and Ralph Waldo Emerson, 1834-1872 (Boston and New York: Houghton, Mifflin & Co., 1892), Vol. I. p. 39.

2/bid., p. 311.

³Frederick William Holls, Correspondence between Ralph Waldo Emerson and Herman Grimm (Boston and New York: 1903), letter of July 10, 1859, p. 41. Gisela von Arnim later became the wife of Herman Grimm.

⁴Frederick B. Wahr, *Emerson and Goethe*, University of Michigan Doctor's Dissertation, Ann Arbor, 1915, p. 74. (By far the most complete study on the subject)

Emerson states emphatically that he rarely reads any book in the original which he can procure in a good version.⁵ We may infer then that Emerson read German with some difficulty and that he was likely to misunderstand or misinterpret difficult passages when reading Goethe in the original. Moreover, since he could not pronounce German he must have entirely missed the beauty of sound, rhythm, rime, and cadence which play an important part in Goethe's lyrical poetry and without which Goethe's poetical work cannot be appreciated.

Added to these obstacles there came the influence of severe Goethe critics. "The fear that German writings were sources of moral contamination....prevailed in New England" before 1817. Dr. Follen, a young native German, who, from 1825 on, lectured at Harvard on German Literature, gave a rather one-sided and negative impression of Goethe. Wordsworth, Coleridge, Lamb, and De Quincey criticised Goethe "for his want of religious enthusiasm." In 1840 Felton's translation of Menzel's History of German Literature appeared. As an opponent of the classical and romantic tradition in literature and as a precurser of "young Germany," Menzel spared no venom and no vituperation in combatting Goethe. Not until Carlyle, Margaret Fuller, Sarah Austin, John S. Dwight and others took up Goethe's cause, was he seen in a more favorable light.6

The third obstacle, Emerson's Puritanical moral idealism, was indeed a hindrance which made him misinterpret, as we shall see, Goethe's personality as well as many of his works. Believing, as he did, that the true function of a great mind was to be a poet and

51Vorks, Centenary Edition, edited by Edw. W. Emerson and Waldo E. Forbes, 12 volumes (Boston and New York: Houghton, Mifflin & Co.) cf. Vol. VII, p. 195: "I rarely read any Latin, Greek, German, Italian, sometimes not a French book, in the original which I can procure in a good version....I should as soon think of swimming across the Charles River when I wish to go to Boston, as of reading all my books in originals when I have them rendered for me in my mother tongue."

6Wahr, pp. 38-65.—Percy H. Boynton in his *History of American Literature* (Ginn and Company, 1919, p. 202) describes Emerson's remarkable intellectual independence in these words: "No single man and no amount of public opinion ever made up this young American's mind for him." In view of the many contradicting statements concerning Goethe, Emerson's struggle for an independent judgment must have been doubly hard.

a priest at the same time, he found Goethe and his work wanting in elevated ethical standards.⁷

Emerson began the study of Goethe with a mature and critical mind. He developed his knowledge of German, as far as we know, by reading Goethe in the original, but later he re-read a great many of his works in translations. It is not surprising, therefore, that we find Emerson's attitude changing with his increasing knowledge of German and the help which he undoubtedly derived from translations. Even though it is impossible to give a clear survey of all his opinions about Goethe, a number of typical quotations taken from his diaries and letters will roughly indicate the gradual change of attitude.⁹

1834 "I cannot read of the jubilee of Goethe and of such velvet life without a sense of incongruity. Genius is out of place when it reposes fifty years on chairs of state, and inhales a continual incense of adulation. Its proper ornamental relief are poverty and reproach and danger; and if the grand duke had cut Goethe's head off, it would have been much better for his fame than his retiring to his rooms, after dismissing the obsequious crowds, to arrange tastefully and contemplate their gifts and honorary inscriptions." 10

7Wahr, pp. 80-107.—Frederick Norman ("Goethe und das heutige England," Jahrbuch der Goethe Gesellschaft, Vol. 17, 1931, p. 221) states: "Der abweisende und eigenwillige Bauerntrotz, dem der Puritanismus zutiefst entsprungen ist, bereitet der Einführung fremder Geisteswelt bis auf unsere Tage die gröszten Schwierigkeiten. Duldsamkeit und Puritanismus sind unvereinbar."

SCalvin Thomas, Emerson's Verhältnis zu Goethe, Goethe-Jahrbuch Vol. 24 (1903), pp. 135-152.

⁹It is advisable to remember Emerson's words concerning consistency in this connection: "A foolish consistency is the hobgoblin of little mindsWith consistency a great soul has simply nothing to do....Speak what you think now in hard words, and tomorrow speak what tomorrow thinks in hard words again, though it contradict everything you said today."—Essay on Self-Reliance. No doubt Emerson simply means that we are entitled to change our opinions according to improving insight.

10 Journals of Ralph Waldo Emerson with Annotations edited by Edw. W. Emerson and Waldo E. Forbes (Boston and New York: 1887), Vol.

III, pp. 251.

For Emerson's dislike of inequality see James Elliot Cabot, A Memoir of Ralph Waldo Emerson (Boston and New York: 1887), Vol. II, pp. 442 f. Compare also Wahr, p. 95, where Emerson is quoted: "What is our graduated and petrified social scale of ranks and employments? Shall not a poet redeem us from these idolatries, and pale their legendary lustre before the fires of Divine Wisdom which burn in his heart?...." Also com-

pare Journal, V, p. 395.

- 1834 (June 20) "....as I....thought of Goethe as the *Tag und Jahres Heft* describes him, he seems to me,—all-sided, gifted, indefatigable student as he is,—to be only another poor monad, after the fashion of his little race bestirring himself immensely to hide his nothingness, spinning his surface directly before the eves to conceal the universe of his ignorance."¹¹
- 1834 (June 26) "Goethe and Carlyle, and perhaps Novalis, have an undisguised dislike or contempt for common virtue standing on common principles. Meanwhile they are dear lovers, steadfast maintainers of the pure ideal morality. But they worship it as the highest pure ideal morality; their love is artisticSelf-cultivation is yet the moral of all that Goethe has writ, and in indolence, intolerance and perversion I think we can spare an olive and a laurel for him...."12
- 1834 (Nov. 20) "With him I am becoming better acquainted but mine must be a qualified admiration....the Puritan in me accepts no apology for bad morals in such as he." 13
- 1834 (Nov. 30) "Goethe is praised asall-sided. And if I understand it, this is the apology that is made for his Epicurean life compared with his religious perceptions..." 14
- 1836 (March 21) "....much I fear that time, the serene judge, will not be able to make out so good a verdict for Goethe as did and doth Carlyle. I am afraid that under his faith is no faith, that under his love is love-of-ease. However, his muse is catholic as ever any was...." In the same entry he speaks of "our wise but sensual, loved and hated Goethe." 15
- 1837 (Apr. 16) "....What have these German Weimarish art friends done?....They are contemptuous. They fail in sympathy with humanity. The voice of nature they bring me to hear is not divine, but ghastly, hard and ironical. They do not illuminate me, they do not edify me...." 16

It is important to note "that in three successive years—1836, 1837, and 1838—Emerson made three statements in summary of his chief ideas on men and things," in his essay on "Nature,"

¹¹ Journal, III, pp. 309 f.

¹² Journal, III, pp. 313 f.

¹³ Carlyle-Emerson Correspondence, p. 30.

¹⁴ Journal, III. p. 315.

¹⁵ Journal, IV, p. 30.

¹⁶ Journal, IV, p. 213.

¹⁷ Boynton, p. 203.

his oration on "The American Scholar," and the "Divinity School Address." As a result of this clarification of his thoughts, Emerson's attitude toward Goethe seems to become less critical, at least his praise is less frequently intermingled with the sting of bitter reproach. Thus he writes:

- 1839 (June 18) "Goethe unlocks the faculties of the artist more than any writer. He teaches us to treat all subjects with greater freedom, and to skip over all obstruction, time, place, name, usage, and come full and strong on the emphasis of the fact." 18
- 1844 (May 8) "Goethe, with his extraordinary breadth of experience and culture, the security with which, like a great continental gentleman, he looks impartially over all literatures of the mountains, the provinces, and the sea, and avails himself of the best in all, contrasts with the rigor of the English, and the superciliousness and the flippancy of the French. His perfect taste, the austere felicities of his style. It is delightful to find our own thought in so great a man." 19
- 1850 "Goethe has not even the devotion to pure truth, but to truth for the sake of culture." ²⁰
- 1851 "Goethe is the pivotal man of the old and the new times with us. He shuts up the old, he opens the new. No matter that you were born since Goethe died,—if you have not read Goetheyou are an old fogy and belong with the antediluvians."²¹

1871 (Jan. 5) "For Goethe, I think, I have an always ascending regard."22

Having gained an approximate idea of Emerson's changing attitude, we shall briefly discuss some of his misconceptions of which we choose three: first, Emerson's Goethe in reference to the "velvet life"; second, Goethe the aristocrat "reposing fifty years on chairs of state"; and third, Goethe wanting in "devotion to pure truth."

I. "THE VELVET LIFE"

That Goethe led an intensely active intellectual life cannot be doubted. The name of Goethe is synonymous with constant, in-

¹⁸ Journal, V. 222.

¹⁹ Journal, VI, 514.

²⁰Ralph Waldo Emerson, Representative Men (Boston: 1892), p. 270. 21Journal, VIII, p. 249.

²²Correspondence between Emerson and Grimm, p. 85.

tense mental activity, and, moreover, no one, perhaps, expresses his belief in work as the greatest necessity of life more convincingly than he:

"Elender ist nichts, als der behagliche Mensch ohne Arbeit, das schönste der Gaben wird ihm Ekel."23 "Des Lebens Mühe lehrt uns allein, des Lebens Güter schätzen."24 "Nur der verdient sich Freiheit wie das Leben, der täglich sie erobern musz."25 "Des echten Mannes wahre Freiheit is die Tat."26 "Die Tat ist alles. nichts der Ruhm."27 "Tätig zu sein ist des Menschen erste Bestimmung und alle Zwischenzeiten, in denen er auszuruhen genötigt ist, sollte er anwenden, eine deutliche Erkenntnis der äuszerlichen Dinge zu erlangen, die ihm in der Folge abermals seine Tätigkeit erleichtert."28 "Man hat mich immer als einen vom Glück besonders Begünstigten gepriesen; auch will ich mich nicht beklagen und den Gang meines Lebens nicht schelten. Allein im Grunde ist es nichts als Mühe und Arbeit gewesen, und ich kann wohl sagen, dasz ich in meinen fünfundsiebzig Jahren keine vier Wochen eigentliches Behagen gehabt. Es war das ewige Wälzen eines Steines, der immer von neuem gehoben sein wollte."29

Emerson shows his changed attitude by correcting his statement in regard to Goethe's "velvet life" about sixteen years later, as follows: "This cheerful laborer, with no external popularity or provocation, drawing his motive and his plan from his own breast, tasked himself with stints for a giant, and without relaxation or rest, except by altering his pursuits, worked on for eighty years with the steadiness of his first zeal." 30

II. "GOETHE THE ARISTOCRAT"

Numerous passages in his works, letters, diaries, and conversations state his position toward the nobility quite clearly. "Es kommt jetzt darauf an, was einer auf dem Wege der Menschheit

²³Tagebuch, Jan. 13, 1779, cf. Goethes Briefe und Tagebücher, Leipzig, Insel Verlag, Vol. II, p. 579.

24 Tasso, V, 1.

25Faust, II, 5.

26 Pandora.

27 Faust, II, 4.

28Wilhelm Meister's Lehrjahre, sechstes Buch, Jubiläums-Ausgabe, Vol. 18, p. 163.

29 J. P. Eckermann, Gespräche mit Goethe, Jan. 27, 1824.

30Representative Men, p. 275.

wiegt, alles übrige ist eitel. Ein Rock mit einem Stern und ein Wagen mit sechs Pferden imponiert nur noch allenfalls der rohesten Masse, und kaum dieser."³¹ "....ich hatte vor der bloszen Fürstlichkeit also solcher, wenn nicht zugleich eine tüchtige Menschennatur dahintersteckte, nie viel Respekt."³² "Soll ich denn also mit Gewalt ein Fürstenknecht sein, so ist es wenigstens mein Trost, dasz ich doch nur der Knecht eines solchen bin, der selber ein Knecht des allgemeinen Besten ist."³³

That Goethe suffered himself to be knighted is often interpreted as a sign of contempt for the common people. In defending himself he says: "Wir Frankfurter Patrizier hielten uns immer dem Adel gleich, und als ich das Diplom in Händen hielt, hatte ich in meinen Gedanken eben nichts, als was ich längst besessen." 34

This humane evaluation of aristocracy we find supplemented by numerous expressions of sympathy with the common people: "Wer ist das würdigste Glied des Staates? Ein wackerer Bürger! Unter jeglicher Form bleibt er der edelste Stoff.³⁵ Biedermann reports that Goethe once defended the burgher class against a haughty nobleman with so much fire, power, and esteem, that the poet Adam Oehlenschläger fell on his neck and kissed him.³⁶.

Even as early as 1777 Goethe wrote to Charlotte von Stein: "Ich habe...das gemeine Volk wieder näher kennen gelernt und bin aber-und abermals vergewissert worden, dasz das doch die besten Menschen sind." "Wie sehr ich wieder auf diesem dunklen Zug Liebe zu der Klasse von Menschen gekriegt habe, die man die niedre nennt! Die aber für Gott gewiss die höchste ist. Da sind doch alle Tugenden beisammen, Beschränktheit, Genügsamkeit, gerader Sinn, Treue, Freude über das leidlichste Gute, Harmlosigkeit, Dulden....Ausharren...., ich will mich nicht in Ausrufen verlieren." 38

Again we find that Emerson modified his view ten years later

```
31 Eckermann, Oct. 23, 1928.
```

³²¹bid., Sept. 26, 1827.

^{33/}bid., Apr. 27, 1825.

³⁴¹bid., Sept. 26, 1827.

³⁵Goethe's Werke, Goedeke edition, Vol. 1, 220.

³⁶Waldemar Biedermann, Goethe's Gesprüche, (Leipzig; 1889) Vol. II, p. 30.

³⁷Robert Zilchert, Von A bis Z Ewigkeitswerte, (Leipzig: 1926) p. 385. 38Goethe's Briefe an Fran von Stein (Leipzig, Reclam), letter of Dec. 4, 1777.

when he writes: "After taxing Goethe as a courtier, artificial, unbelieving, worldly,—I took up his book of Helena, and found him an Indian of the wilderness, a piece of pure nature like an apple or an oak, large as morning or night, and virtuous as a briar rose." 39

III. "GOETHE WANTING IN "DEVOTION TO PURE TRUTH"

By pure truth Emerson means eternal, supernatural or absolute truth, and, therefore, his criticism might have been made by any idealistic philosopher who, like Emerson, believed philosophy could reveal the last and profoundest secrets of life. Goethe kept aloof from all systems of philosophy. He states: "Der Mensch ist nicht geboren, die Probleme der Welt zu lösen, wohl aber zu suchen, wo das Problem angeht, und sich sodann in der Grenze der Begrifflichkeiten zu halten. Die Handlungen des Universums zu messen, reichen seine Fähigkeiten nicht hin, und in das Weltall Vernunft bringen zu wollen, ist bei seinem kleinen Standpunkte ein sehr vergebliches Bestreben."40 "Unsere wichtigste Differenz war diese, dasz ich behauptete, eine abgesonderte Philosophie sei nicht nötig, indem sie schon in der Religion und Poesie vollkommen enthalten sei."41 "Da hat mir jetzt so ein über-Hegel aus Berlin seine philosophischen Bücher zugeschickt, das ist wie eine Klapperschlange; man will das verdammte Zeug fliehen und guckt doch hinein. Der Kerl greift es tüchtig an, bohrt gewaltig in die Probleme hinein, von denen ich vor achzig Jahren so viel als jetzt wuszte, und von denen wir alle nichts wissen und begreifen. Jetzt habe ich die Bücher versiegelt, um nicht wieder zum Lesen verführt zu werden."42 "Das Wahre, mit dem Göttlichen identisch, läszt sich niemals von uns direkt erkennen, wir schauen es nur im Abglanz, im Beispiel, Symbol, im einzelnen...; wir werden es gewahr als unbegreifliches Leben und können dem Wunsche nicht entsagen, es dennoch zu begreifen."43 "Das schönste Glück des denkenden Menschen ist, das Erforschliche erforscht zu haben und das Unerforschliche ruhig zu erehren."44

^{39&}quot;Nominalist and Realist," Works, III, p. 230.

⁴⁰Eckermann, Apr. 1, 1927.

⁴¹ Dichtung und Wahrheit, Jubiläums-Ausgabe, Vol. 23, p. 7.

⁴²Goethe to von Müller, Apr. 24, 1830; cf. Max Heynacher, Goethes Philosophic aus seinen Werken (Leipzig: 1905), p. 1.

⁴³ Versuch einer Farbenlehre, 1825, cf. Heynacher, p. 34.

⁴⁴Goethe Handbuch, Stuttgart 1916, Vol. III, p. 125, also p. 119.

There is no statement indicating that Emerson changed his opinion in regard to Goethe's lack of devotion to pure truth. If, however, Emerson had been familiar with Goethe's position on philosophy, he probably would have repeated the words which he once wrote to the Reverend Henry Ware: I do "not feel any disposition to depart from my habitual contentment, that you may say your thought, whilst I say mine." 45

These points may stand as examples of Emerson's criticisms of Goethe which, in part at least, we find modified or corrected by Emerson himself in later years. At the same time these examples help to explain Emerson's comments on individual works of Goethe. Of Dichtung und Wahrheit he said Goethe knew "altogether too much of himself." Tasso he liked with reservations. Iphigenie he thought "pleasing," "moving," and "even heroic," but an "imitation of the antique." Elective Affinities he regarded with repulsion. For Wilhelm Meister he found words of utmost praise, its ending, however, he considered "lame and immoral." He hated Faust as a bad book, but later came to regard its second part as "the grandest enterprise of literature....attempted since Paradise Lost "47

Yet, Emerson seems to have been keenly conscious of the difficulties and dangers of literary criticism. Indeed, he was suspicious of his own judgment. In April 1840 he writes to Carlyle: "In a lecture on Literature in my course last winter, I blurted out all my nonsense" on the subject of Goethe. Again, he says: "If you criticize a true genius the odds are that you are criticizing your own caricature of him. For there is somewhat spheral and infinite in every man, especially in every genius, which, if you can come very near him, sports with all your limitations. every man is a channel through which Heaven floweth and whilst I fancied I was criticizing him, I was censuring or rather terminating my own soul." Our English nature and genius has made us the worst critics of Goethe. "I am disqualified by hearing this strife concerning Goethe from judging truly his genius. He is that which the

⁴⁵Cf. letter quoted by Boynton, p. 207.

⁴⁶ Journal, VII, p. 303.

⁴⁷ Wahr, pp. 107-118.

⁴⁸Works, Vol. III, p. 230.

⁴⁹¹bid., Vol. VIII, p. 69. See also Frederick Norman, (op. cit., p. 219) in regard to English animosity to things foreign.

intelligent hermit supposes him to be, and can neither be talked up nor talked down,"50

This relentless self-criticism suggests that Emerson felt his knowledge of Goethe to be incomplete. When we recall his poem, "Solution," in which he mentions Goethe with Homer, Dante, Shakespeare, and Swedenborg among the men he considers the greatest bards of the ages, this suggestion becomes almost a certainty.

Emerson valued in Goethe not so much the poet or the artist, but the scientist, scholar, sage, prophet, and seer. In spite of his linguistic difficulties, in spite of the prejudices of his time, and the religious, philosophic, ethical, and political convictions which separated him from Goethe, Emerson's Goethe was far superior to the Goethe of many a scholar writing decades later.⁵¹. His Goethe, though hated and yet beloved, was a gigantic figure, prodigiously learned, eminently able, the wisest of modern men.

If we ask whether or not Goethe exerted a significant influence on Emerson, we can answer in the latter's own words: "It is to me very plain that no recent genius can work with equal effect upon mankind as Goethe, for no intelligent young man can read him without finding that his own compositions are immediately modified by his new knowledge." ⁵² In Emerson's works there are sixty-two quotations from Goethe. ⁵³

Emerson's regard for Goethe was seemingly much greater than most of the entries in the diaries lead us to believe. Moncure D. Conway, writing in 1864 of his visit to Emerson, tells us that there were many "relics" of a "Goethe cult" in Emerson's study. "On the mantle were two statuettes of Goethe, of whom there were also engraved portraits on the walls." Later Emerson produced "eight

50 Journal, III, p. 474.

51J. Arthur Hill, for instance, (in *Emerson and his Philosophy*, London, 1919, p. 107) criticizes *Representative Men* as follows: "Goethe seems unneces-

sary after Shakespeare."

Professor Edward Dowden, the second president of the "English Goethe Society" once played the advocatus diaboli in a lecture entitled: The Case against Goethe. (cf. Frederick Norman, op. cit., p. 232). Dowden's captions were: "A severe indictment, His want of purpose, His artistic inconsistency, His relations with women, His want of insight, His great failure." The English Press actually mistook Dowden's humor for a serious accusation and printed the lecture as such. See for instance Review of Reviews, London Vol. XIII, p. 523.

52 Journal, IV, p. 218.

⁵³Wahr, p. 104.

or ten portraits of Goethe which he had carefully collected. The next in favor was Dante...." Conway also relates of another, perhaps not less significant relic of the Goethe cult. Emerson's little daughter called her handsome cat "Goethe." Emerson affected to take it seriously, and once when the cat was in the library and scratched itself, he opened the door and politely said: "Goethe, you must retire, I don't like your manners." 54

In order to conclude on a more positive note, I shall give a few sentences from Emerson's last and most significant comment on Goethe, contained in his book *Representative Men*, in which the last essay deals with "Goethe—the Writer":

"He seems to see out of every pore of his skin, strikes the harp with a hero's strength and grace (p. 259). There is a heart-cheering freedom in his speculation. The immense horizon which journeys with us lends its majesty to trifles and to matters of convenience and necessity, as to solemn and festal performances (p. 260). He has clothed our modern existence with poetry (ibid.). He has said the best things about nature that ever were said (p. 261).... what he says of religion, of passion, of marriage, of manners, of property,....of periods of belief, of omens,....or whatever else, refuses to be forgotten (p. 263)....he flung into literature, in his Mephistopheles, the first organic figure that has been added for some ages, and which will remain as long as Prometheus (p. 264). The old Eternal Genius who built the world has confided himself more to this man than to any other (p. 270). He lays a ray of light under every fact, and between himself and his dearest property. From him nothing was hid, nothing withholden (p. 271)...he has brought back to a book some of its ancient might and dignity (p. 275). He was the soul of his century (p. 260)."

⁵⁴Ibid., p. 79.—Emerson's deep-rooted individualism was closely related to Goethe's high conception of personality and, in part at least, accounts for the "Goethe cult." For Emerson's inner relationship to German traits of character see Kuno Franke, "Emerson and German Personality," The International Quarterly, 1903, Vol. VIII, pp. 93-107.